

## Message

**From:** Holst, Linda [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=97E4A65ADDD9494FA193C98DD5D12B55-LHOLST]  
**Sent:** 9/22/2016 5:46:07 PM  
**To:** Thomas Poleck [Poleck.Thomas@epa.gov]  
**Subject:** FW: EPA Conductivity Benchmark Analysis  
**Attachments:** Region V memo 20160204.Finalsmc.pdf; InvertsWFieldChem\_Rev20150123.zip

FYI

---

**From:** Marko, Katharine  
**Sent:** Wednesday, September 21, 2016 3:50 PM  
**To:** Holst, Linda <holst.linda@epa.gov>; Pfeifer, David <pfeifer.david@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** FW: EPA Conductivity Benchmark Analysis

---

**From:** McKim, Krista  
**Sent:** Wednesday, September 21, 2016 3:42 PM  
**To:** Wester, Barbara <wester.barbara@epa.gov>; Pierard, Kevin <pierard.kevin@epa.gov>; Marko, Katharine <Marko.Katharine@epa.gov>; Bauer, Candice <bauer.candice@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** FW: EPA Conductivity Benchmark Analysis

FYI

---

**From:** Cormier, Susan  
**Sent:** Wednesday, September 21, 2016 3:26 PM  
**To:** Paula Maccabee <pmaccabee@justchangelaw.com>  
**Subject:** RE: EPA Conductivity Benchmark Analysis

Dear Ms. Maccabee, Esq,

I am responding to your email of September 13, 2016. Earlier this year, I prepared a review for EPA Region V regarding the report: *An Evaluation of a Field-Based Aquatic Life Benchmark for Specific Conductance in Northeast Minnesota*. In response to your request, I have attached both the review and the MPCA data set used for that review which has been shared with others earlier this summer.

You have also requested data associated with work that may or may not proceed to publication. If that work is released for public comment, the accompanying data sets will also be made publically available at that time.

Your email also requested any publications that were "salient in developing the EPA's draft conductivity benchmark method." It is not clear to me what these might be. However, most of my published work can be obtained at <https://www.researchgate.net>. On the topic of effects of salts on aquatic life, you may be interested in publications that appeared in *Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry* in a single issue in January 2013 and were derivative of research published in the U.S. EPA's 2011 document entitled "A Field-based Aquatic Life Benchmark for Conductivity in Central Appalachian Streams (Final Report) available at <https://cfpub.epa.gov/ncea/risk/recordisplay.cfm?deid=233809&CFID=68636925&CFTOKEN=51731960>.

Thank you for your inquiry.

Respectfully,

Susan M. Cormier, Ph. D.  
National Center for Environmental Assessment  
Office of Research and Development  
U.S. EPA  
26 W. M. L. King Dr  
Cincinnati, OH 45268  
Office (513) 569-7995  
Alternate (513) 232-1657

---

**From:** Paula Maccabee [<mailto:pmaccabee@justchangelaw.com>]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, September 13, 2016 2:54 PM  
**To:** Cormier, Susan <[Cormier.Susan@epa.gov](mailto:Cormier.Susan@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** EPA Conductivity Benchmark Analysis

Dear Susan,

I understand that you have been the primary author of the document that the EPA is currently finalizing establishing a broadly- applicable methodology for setting a conductivity benchmark. WaterLegacy greatly appreciates the EPA's work moving from the more limited study in Appalachia finalized in 2011 to a methodology that can be applied to protect waters and aquatic life throughout the nation, including our waters in Minnesota.

I understand that the report prepared by Bruce Johnson and Maureen Johnson, *An Evaluation of a Field-Based Aquatic Life Benchmark for Specific Conductance in Northeast Minnesota* (November 2015) has been distributed and reviewed within EPA in connection with this EPA analysis. If you or others at EPA have prepared any review of the Johnson report on conductivity, we would appreciate if you would send it to us at your earliest convenience.

WaterLegacy would also appreciate a copy of any data sets that were used in developing the draft EPA conductivity criteria benchmark method.

If there were any other reports or published literature that were particularly salient in developing the EPA's draft conductivity criteria benchmark method, we would also request copies of these materials.

Please do not hesitate to contact me at 651-646-8890 if you have any questions about our requests for information.

Thank you for your scientific work and for your assistance.

Sincerely yours,  
Paula

Paula Maccabee, Esq.  
JUST CHANGE LAW OFFICES  
1961 Selby Ave.  
St. Paul MN 55104  
phone: 651-646-8890  
fax: 651-646-5754  
Cell: 651-775-7128  
e-mail: [pmaccabee@justchangelaw.com](mailto:pmaccabee@justchangelaw.com)  
<http://www.justchangelaw.com>

Advocacy Director/Counsel for WaterLegacy